

UNIVERSITI TEKNOLOGI MARA

**THE EFFECTIVENESS OF LAND USE
PLANNING IN URBAN HOUSING
DEVELOPMENTS IN SELANGOR**

HAMIZAH YAKOB

Thesis submitted in fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
(Built Environment)

Faculty of Architecture, Planning and Surveying

December 2017

ABSTRACT

Land use planning are considered to be some of the contributing factors in achieving better housing development mainly in urban areas. However, the effectiveness of land use planning for housing development is still questionable, leading to issues related to housing shortages, location, housing choices and its quality. The shortcomings in the implementation of land use planning practice for housing development have arguably contributed to these problems. The research sets out to examine the effectiveness of development plans and planning control in terms of its implementation in urban housing development in Selangor. Four objectives outlines which highlights the current housing planning activities in preparing development plans including formulation of policy; determination of land location, land size as well as guidelines; and its implementation through planning control during housing applications and approvals, were analysed based on the perception of respondents. The research is measured through quantitative analysis based on a structured questionnaire survey conducted among government planners and planning consultants. To further explore the issues and problems, expert interviews were conducted with expert town planners. For fourth objective, the strength and weaknesses of planning aspects influencing housing development were analysed using an IPA Matrix which focuses on important items that require high attention for improvement based on its effectiveness. Findings reveal that there are weaknesses in the implementation of development plans within its policy, development strategies and planning control process. The situation is worsened by the incompetence of local planning authorities in decision making. The study also reveals several issues inherent in the process of housing application approvals. Among them are the difficulties caused by the time consumed for the adoption of development plans due to gazetting period, poor content of development policies on housing control, consequently leading to low level of compliance with low cost housing policies, land use zoning and housing category. The study also found that the ineffectiveness of the land use planning system is due to lack of consideration of economic aspects of housing planning such as housing market demands. The findings of the research indicate a vital need for change in the approach and practice of housing planning in development plans and implementation through planning control. This can be achieved by making improvements in the current housing planning activities through decision making, recommendations and technical analysis in preparing the development plans that are suited to the economic environment.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I begin in the name of ALLAH, most merciful. I wish to thank Him for giving me the opportunity to embark on my PhD with strength and emotional support, and for completing this long, very challenging and lonely journey successfully. I owe my deepest gratitude to those who have helped me through the process of completing this research. It is a pleasure to thank those who made this thesis possible.

My gratitude and thanks go to my supervisor Assoc. Prof. Dr. Fatimah Yusof, and co-supervisor, Assoc. Prof. Dr. Hazlina Hamdan. Thank you for the support, patience, encouraging guidance, ideas and discussions that made this research study to what it is.

I also would like to express my gratitude to the staff of Selangor Town and Country Planning Department (TCPD), especially Mr. Hassan Yaakob and Mrs. Saidah Ahmed, Tuan Haji Azaman and Mrs. Khairunnisa Mustapha from Federal TCPD, Mr. Mohd Hafiz Hassan from *Lembaga Perumahan dan Hartanah Selangor* for providing the facilities, knowledge and assistance. My appreciation goes to all principals of planning consultant firms especially Mrs. Khairiah Talha, Tuan Haji Ihsan Zainal Mokhtar and Mr. Mohd Asri Husin who were willing to share their meaningful experience and giving ideas during expert interview sessions. Special thanks to my colleagues and friends for helping me with this research study.

My special appreciation to my beloved mama, Anisah Haji Abd. Ghaffar, and ayah, Yakob Sukirman, whose endless love and support throughout my life can never be repaid. This piece of victory is dedicated to both of you. Love and special thanks to my dear husband, Mohd Annas Firdaus Borhanodin for his support, help, encouragement, understanding and for everything. And also my lovely kids, A'isyah Humayra' and Ahmad Hudzaifah as my strength throughout my PhD's study. Finally, many thanks to my family members for their continuous moral support. Thank you so much and Alhamdulillah.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
CONFIRMATION BY PANEL OF EXAMINERS	ii
AUTHOR'S DECLARATION	iii
ABSTRACT	iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS	vi
LIST OF TABLES	xiii
LIST OF FIGURES	xvi
LIST OF PLATES	xviii
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	xix
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 Research Background	1
1.2 Research Problem	3
1.2.1 Research Problem 1	4
1.2.2 Research Problem 2	5
1.2.3 Research Problem 3	7
1.3 Research Aim and Objectives	11
1.3.1 Research Aim	11
1.3.2 Research Objectives	11
1.4 Research Questions	11
1.5 Research Scope	14
1.6 Research Approach and Its Structure	17
1.7 Research Problems and Limitations	23
CHAPTER TWO: LAND USE PLANNING AND PROCESS OF HOUSING DEVELOPMENT	25
2.1 Introduction	25

2.2	Town Planning System in Malaysia	26
2.2.1	Planning Structure	27
2.2.2	Function of Town and Country Planning Act 1976 (Act 172)	27
2.2.3	Planning Mechanisms	29
2.2.3.1	Development Planning System	32
2.2.3.2	Planning Control System	44
2.3	Planning Practice for Housing Development in the Developed and Developing Countries	47
2.3.1	Planning Practice for Housing Development in the Developed Countries	47
2.3.1.1	Housing Planning Practice in the United Kingdom	47
2.3.1.2	Housing Policies in the United States of America	50
2.3.1.3	Housing Planning Practice in Australia and New Zealand	54
2.3.1.4	Housing Planning Practice in Hong Kong and Singapore	55
2.3.2	Planning Practice for Housing Development in the Developing Countries	58
2.3.2.1	Housing Planning Practice in Malaysia	58
2.3.2.2	Housing Planning Practice in Indonesia	60
2.4	Land Use Planning System and Control in the Development Process	62
2.4.1	Definition of Land Use Planning	62
2.4.2	Models in the Development Process	63
2.4.3	Rationale for Land Use Planning to Intervene in the Development Process	67
2.5	Land Use Planning and Control in the Housing Development Process	69
2.5.1	Issues and Challenges in Malaysian Urban Housing Planning	69
2.5.2	Role of Land Use Planning System in Housing Development Process	73
2.5.3	Barriers in Implementing Housing Planning and Control	76
2.6	Conclusion	80

CHAPTER THREE: PLANNING MECHANISMS AND CONTROL PROCESS

	IN HOUSING DEVELOPMENTS	83
3.1	Introduction	83
3.2	Housing Development Process in Malaysia	84
3.3	Development Plans for Housing	87