

# **A LEGAL STUDY ON MEDICAL APOLOGY**

By

Mohd Rizlan Shah bin Izman (2010850158)

Rahmat bin Mohamed Hazlan (2010893238)

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements  
for the Bachelor in Legal Studies (Hons)

**Universiti Teknologi MARA**  
**Faculty of Law**

December 2012

The students confirm that the work submitted is their own and that appropriate credit has been given where reference has been made to the work of others.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

**In the name of Allah, The Most Gracious, The Most Merciful, All the praises and thanks be to Allah, the Lord of the ‘Alamin, The Most Gracious, The Most Merciful. The only owner of the day of Recompense, You (Alone) we worship and You (Alone) we ask for help, Guide us to the straightway, The way of those on whom You have bestowed Your grace, Not of those who earned Your anger, Nor of those who went astray. We give special thanks to the people who, one way or another had shared in our activities, may Allah, subhana wa ta’ala, bless and guide us to the right path.**

First and foremost, we would like to thank our supervisor of this research, Madam Nurazlina bt Abdul Raof for the valuable guidance and advice. She inspired us greatly to work in this research. Her willingness to motivate us contributed tremendously to our research. We would also like to express our sincere gratitude to Dr. Noraiza Abdul Rahman and Associate Professor Sue Valquis Md Mashhor who were kind enough to provide substantial information for our research. We would like to take this immense pleasure to thank Mr. Izuan Izzaidi Azmi for suggesting the topic on medical apology in the first place. Apart from that, we would like to thank our parents for giving us moral support throughout our research. It is only with their blessing that we gain the inspiration to persevere. Finally, we are very grateful to our friends and everyone else who has directly or indirectly helped us in the completion of this research. Words are inadequate in offering our thanks to everyone. The success of this research depends largely on the encouragement and guidelines of others.

## **ABSTRACT**

The reputation of the medical profession has been questioned on numerous occasions. Despite being highly respected by the society, refusal of doctors to apologize whenever there occurs an adverse event has caused a serious dent to their status as lifesavers. This leads to the argument of whether we should have a law to protect a doctor's statement of apology by making it inadmissible to establish liability in court. This research will highlight the underlying principles behind an apology law and the need of having the law to protect a statement of apology by doctors. We will look into cases in other countries and how liability can be established based on disclosure and apology. Furthermore, the research will study various statutes from Canada, United Kingdom and the United States of America that govern a statement of apology. Data and information of this research were gathered from books, journals, online articles and interviews with academicians. It is hoped that this research will fulfill the objectives and will be a guideline in determining whether there should be a law to protect medical apologies in Malaysia.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgment	ii
Abstract	iii
Contents	iv
List of Cases	vi
List of Statutes	vii

### CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.0	Introduction	1
1.1	Background	1
1.2	Problem Statement	2
1.3	Objectives	3
1.4	Significance of the Research	3
1.5	Scope and Limitations of the Research	4
1.6	Research Methodology	5
1.7	Outline	5
1.8	Conclusion	6

### CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.0	Introduction	7
2.1	Dimensions in Defining Apology	7
2.2	Admissibility of Apology	10
	2.2.1 Establishing Liability	11
	2.2.2 Authors' Analysis of Cases	12
	2.2.2.1 The United States of America	13
	2.2.2.2 Canada	15
2.3	The Need for Apology	17
2.4	Conclusion	22

### CHAPTER THREE: THE LEGALITY OF MEDICAL APOLOGY

3.0	Introduction	23
3.1	The Evidence Act of Malaysia	23
3.2	The Apology Act of Canada	24
3.3	The Compensation Act of United Kingdom	26
3.4	The Evidence Laws of The United States of America	28
3.5	Conclusion	31

### CHAPTER FOUR: ACADEMICIANS' VIEWPOINT ON MEDICAL APOLOGY

4.0	Introduction	32
4.1	Associate Professor Sue Valquis Md Mashhor	32
4.2	Dr. Noraiza Abdul Rahman	34
4.3	Conclusion	37

## **CHAPTER FIVE: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

5.0	Introduction	38
5.1	Advantages of Medical Apology Law	38
5.2	Disadvantages of Medical Apology Law	40
5.3	Establishment of Research Objectives	42
5.4	Recommendations	43