A LEGAL ANALYSIS ON THE DOCTRINE OF MINISTERIAL RESPONSIBILITY IN COMMONWEALTH COUNTRIES

By

| Mohd Nor Hafidzuddin bin Yusoff | 2010985897 |
|------------------------------------|------------|
| Nurul Nabila binti Hasni | 2010792541 |
| Asmarina Sakila binti Kamarolzaman | 2010177013 |

•.

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements

For the Bachelor in Legal Studies (Hons)

Universiti Teknologi MARA

Faculty of Law

June 2013

The students/ authors confirm that the work submitted is their own and that appropriate credit has been given made to the work of others.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

In The Name of Allah The Most Merciful and the Most Forgiving

First and foremost, we would like to thank Allah (the most Glorified, The Most High) for His blessing upon our completion of this project paper that had been conducted for two semesters. With His guidance we managed to complete our project paper with full commitment given by each and every one of us.

The purpose of this project paper being conducted is to fulfill the requirement in finishing the Bachelor of Legal Studies (Honours). This tremendous combination of hardwork and effort is done by Mohd Nor Hafidzuddin bin Yusoff, Asmarina Sakila bt Kamarolzaman and Nurul Nabila bt Hasni, ourselves.

۰.

The success of this research paper is mainly contributed by a lot of people directly and indirectly. Therefore, we would like to first give our greatest thanks and appreciation to our supervisor, Pn. Noraini Md Shah for her endless support in guiding us upon completing our project paper from the very beginning to the end. Her support and advises are very much appreciated.

We would like to extend our utmost gratitude to Professor Shad Saleem Faruqi, UiTM law advisor, a constitutional expert, and Mr Malike Ibrahim, a lecturer from Universiti Utara Malaysia(UUM) for the interview and information gained.

Finally, we would like give our biggest gratitude to our parents, family and friends for their endless support, advise and financial support, direct and indirectly. This project paper can never been completed without all of them.

ABSTRACT

This research traces the origin and the development of the doctrine of Ministerial Responsibility in Malaysia, United Kingdom, Australia and Canada. Comparison has been made between Malaysia, United Kingdom, Australia and Canada to know the development of the doctrine in order to preserve its dignity and importance as it has its own role and shall be uphold in parliamentary tradition. In Malaysia the development of the doctrine in ensuring answerability and accountability of ministers is not effective as compare to the other commonwealth countries.

In United Kingdom, Australia and Canada, the convention on Ministerial responsibility has been properly codified in various codes that provide guidelines for minister in performing their duty and in ensuring the integrity of the minister and the government as a whole. In contrast, in Malaysia there is only guidelines, power and methods of appointment of ministers that is provided in Article 39-43 of Federal Constitution and Ministerial Function Act 1969.

The doctrine of ministerial responsibility is very essential and important in parliamentary system. It is necessary for the government to maintain unity for effectiveness and confidence of electoral support.

Thus this research will consider the suitability of the code of ministerial conduct that to be adopted in Malaysia.

TABLE OF CONTENT

| Acknowledgements Abstract Contents List of Codes and Statutes | ii iii iv vi |
|---|--------------------------------------|
| CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION 1.0 Introduction 1.1 Research Background 1.2 Problem Statement 1.3 Research Objectives 1.4 Research Methodology 1.5 Scope of Research 1.6 Limitation of Research 1.7 Significance of Research | 1 3 5 7 7 8 |
| CHAPTER TWO: DOCTRINE OF MINISTERIAL RESPONSIBILITY 2.0 Introduction 2.1 Further look into the doctrine of Ministerial Responsibility 2.2 The application of the doctrine in commonwealth countries 2.2.1 United Kingdom 2.2.2 Australia 2.2.3 Canada 2.2.4 Malaysia | 9 9 13 13 17 21 28 |
| CHAPTER THREE: COMPARISON OF THE PRACTISE IN UNITED KINGDOM, MALAYSIA, AUSTRALIA AND CANADA | |
| 3.0 Introduction 3.1 Comparison on the ministerial code of ethics in commonwealth countries 3.2 Comparison of Resignation Patterns 3.3 Conclusion | 33 33 44 50 |
| CHAPTER FOUR: CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS 4.0 Introduction 4.1 Conclusion 4.2 Recommendations 4.2.1 Establishing Malaysia Ministerial Code of Conduct 4.2.2 Parliamentary Reform | 51 51 52 52 54 |
| BIBLIOGRAPHY APPENDICES APPENDIX 1 APPENDIX 2 | 57 62 69 |

LIST OF CODES AND STATUTES

- 1.) Accountable Government: A Guide for Ministers of State 2011
- 2.) Federal Constitution
- 3.) Guide on Key Elements of Ministerial Responsibility 1998
- 4.) Ministerial Code: A Code of Conduct and Guidance on Procedures for Ministers
- 5.) Ministerial Function Act 1969
- 6.) Standards of Ministerial Conduct