MALAY RESERVE LAND: HOW TO TURN A BASKETFUL OF PROBLEMS INTO A BOUQUET OF OPPORTUNITIES

By

Nurdeenie Abdul Rashid (2006828097) Samira Khalili (2006828065)

Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Bachelor in Legal Studies (Hons)

> Universiti Teknologi MARA Faculty of Law

> > October 2008

The students/authors confirm the work submitted is their own and that appropriate credit has been given where reference has been made to the works of others.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This research project has been written principally in partial fulfilment of the requirements set under the Bachelor in Legal Studies (Hons). Full responsibility is assumed for any errors that undoubtedly exist in this paper. This research project is a conjunction of work carried out by Miss Nurdeenie Abdul Rashid and Miss Samira Khalili. Alhamdulillah, endless praises to Allah as we have successfully completed this paper. We wish to express our utmost gratitude and appreciation to a number of people, without whom, this paper would never have been realised. First and foremost, our love goes out to our families for their constant moral support. Our special thank you goes to our Supervisor, Puan Hamsiah Omar for her assistance, suggestions and criticisms throughout the whole process of completing this paper; Professor Salleh Buang and Encik Shahrom Ariffin for taking time out of their busy schedule and allowing us to bombard them with question after question; and finally our special thanks also to our colleagues who have either directly or indirectly lent a hand, most of all to Ayusuffina Mohd Abdad, Nurul Nabila Zamri and Hazida Suzanna Hamzah. Without all of you, we would still be at the first page of the paper. Thank You.

Nurdeenie Abdul Rashid Samira Khalili

ABSTRACT

Too many people have commented on the policy of Malay Reserve Land. You have a group of people that holds it a sentiment to heart and then you have the group averse to the whole idea of the policy. What is undoubtedly agreed by all parties however, is that attached to a Malay Reserve Land is an abundance of problems; a basketful of problems. Therefore, this paper is aimed to look in to the ways in which this basketful of problems can be turned into a bouquet of opportunities. Therefore, this paper is aimed to look in to the ways in which this basketful of problems can be turned into a bouquet of opportunities. The focal purpose of this paper is to determine the problems underlying Malay Reserve Lands and to offer recommendations on how to resolve it. Firstly, the fact that the lands are of a lower value than other normal lands will be looked at and the reasons as to why it is so. The policy of Malay Reserve Land under land acquisition by the government will also be looked at. Besides that, a comparison will also be made between the Malay Reservation Enactment 1933 (Cap. 142) that involves the former Federated Malay States with the five other State Enactments involving the former Unfederated Malay States, and in doing so, proving the need of uniformity and cohesiveness of laws regarding Malay Reserve Land. The study will also dissect each scheme of prohibition in all the significant laws.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgement	ii
Abstract	iii
Table of Contents	iv

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.0	Introduction	1
1.1	Problem Statement	3
1.2	Research Questions	5
1.3	Objective of the Research	5
1.4	Literature Review	6
1.5	Methodology	9
1.6	Limitation	10
1.7	Significance of the Research	10
1.8	Provisional Plan of the Research	11
1.9	Conclusion	12

CHAPTER TWO: FEDERATED MALAY STATES MALAY RESERVATION ENACTMENT (CAP.142) 1933 AND THE FIVE OTHER STATE ENACTMENTS WITHIN PENINSULAR MALAYSIA

2.0	Introduc	luction			
2.1	Federate	ed Malay States Malay Reservation Enactment (Cap. 142) 1933			
2.2	Other Le	egislations			
	2.2.1	Constitutional Basis of Malay Reservation			
	2.2.2	The Five	Other State Enactments	18	
2.3	Conceptual Issues within each Enactment			19	
	2.3.1	Definition of Malay		19	
	2.3.2	Built-in Device			
	2.3.3	Ruler In Council		21	
	2.3.4	Extent of Prohibition		21	
		2.3.4.1	Alienation by the State	22	
		2.3.4.2	The Concept of Lease	22	
		2.3.4.3	Charges	23	
		2.3.4.4	Caveats and Other Incidental Dealings	25	
2.4	Conclusion			26	

CHAPTER THREE: POLICY OF MALAY RESERVE LAND AGAINST LAND ACQUISITION BY THE GOVERNMENT

3.0	Introdu	iction		
3.1	Land Acquisition by the Government		28	
	3.1.1	Federal Constitution		
	3.1.2	Land Acquisition Act 1969		29
		3.1.2.1	Background	29
		3.1.2.2	Rights and Obligations of the Government	
	3.1.3	Legal Pro	Legal Protection of Citizens Against Compulsory Acquisition	
		3.1.3.1	Challenging the Acquisition	34
		3.1.3.2	Rule of Compensation	35
3.2	Malay	Reserve La	nd v Acquisition by the Government	
	3.2.1	Compulsory Acquisition of Malay Reserve Lands		38
	3.2.2	Policy of Replacement		
3.3	Conclu	sion		40

CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC STRUGGLES FACED BY MALAY RESERVE LAND OWNERS

Introduction	41
Problems of Credit Facilities	42
4.1.1 Legal Standpoint	43
4.1.2 Economic Standpoint	45
Value of Malay Reserve Land	47
4.2.1 The Real Property Market	47
Lack of Incentive to Develop Malay Reserve Land	49
4.3.1 Infrastructure Issues	49
Multiple Ownership and Size Issues	50
Conclusion	50
	Problems of Credit Facilities4.1.1Legal Standpoint4.1.2Economic StandpointValue of Malay Reserve Land4.2.1The Real Property MarketLack of Incentive to Develop Malay Reserve Land4.3.1Infrastructure IssuesMultiple Ownership and Size Issues