THE PRINCIPLE OF FAIR DEALING IN LIGHT WITH THE COPYRIGHT ACT: A COMPARATIVE STUDY BETWEEN MALAYSIA AND THE UNITED STATES

By

FAEEZATUL FADILLAH BT DAHALAN	2010114513
NUR ALIAH BT ROHAIZAN	2010332769
NURUL ATIQAH BT SAM KAMARUDDIN	2010957093
NURUS SAKINATUL FIKRIAH	2010810698

Submitted in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirements for the Bachelor of Legal Studies (Hons)

University Teknologi MARA Faculty of Law

June 2013

The students/authors confirm that the work submitted is their own and that appropriate credit has been given where reference has been made to the work of others.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

In the name of Allah the most beneficent the most merciful, we would like to thank Him for giving us the strength to complete this research paper.

This research paper has been carried out by a team consisting of Faeezatul Fadillah Bt Dahalan, Nur Aliah Bt Rohaizan, Nurul Atiqah Bt Sam Kamaruddin and Nurus Sakinatul Fikriah Bt Mohd Shith Putera. We have contributed from the first step, by collecting information until the final completion of this project paper. The materials that we had collected were distributed equally among us and each of us analysed those materials and discussed the findings.

First and foremost, we would like to thank and give our deepest gratitude to our supervisor, Puan Mardiah Hayati for her continuous guidance and effort in assisting us to complete this research proposal within 14 weeks. Special thanks goes to our beloved families especially to our parents for their loves and support throughout the period for completing this proposal. We would also like to thank our friends for their never ending support.

Our gratitude goes to Professor Dr. Ida Madieha Abd Ghani Azmi and Professor Madya Rohazar Wati Zuallcobley, both a prominent lecturer in Intellectual Property. We are also very thankful to Mrs Siti Salwa Hj Ghazali, Senior Assistant Director of Copyright, Intellectual Property (Myipo) for her willingness to accept our interview. With their help, we have discovered a different point of view in respect to the defence of fair dealing and its application in Malaysia to be used as the very basic understanding.

We hope that this proposal will be a great success useful to other researchers and to those having the intention to pursue their research in this area or any other research which is connected in one way or another with our proposal. We also hope that it will be contributed and significant to our nations.

ii

ABSTRACT

This research has been conducted to analyse the existing legal framework in Malaysia governing the fair dealing principle where, special references have been made to the legal position in the United States of America. The research aims to examine the adequacy of Malaysian law regarding the defence of fair dealing with regard to copyright infringement.

Presumably, this defence has been criticized for its failure to balance the rights between the owner of the copyright and the user, and to scrutinize the recent amendment to fair dealing in Malaysia's provision which has adopted the four- factor test from US's fair use provision in providing guidelines to the court in determining the use of another's work as a fair use or vice versa. Fair dealing in Malaysia is said to be inflexible and too rigid in deciding whether certain use by the user over the author's work can made the user liable for infringement even the use is still within the context of educational and non-profit purposes.

Admittedly, the rating of cases on fair dealing in Malaysia may seem insignificant compared to other countries, but we seek for our country to take the lead in perfecting the people's need, be it from the smallest issue to the biggest. Therefore, several recommendations which have been acquired during this research and the input from the experts in this matter have been laid out in hope that they could fill the gaps in the knowledge on the current laws governing fair dealing in Malaysia.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgement		ii
Abstract		iii
Contents		iv
List of cases	χ.	vi

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

.

1	.0	Introduction	1	
1	.1	Research Background	1	
1	.2	Research Question	3	
1	.3	Research Objectives	4	
1	.4	Research Methodology	4	
1	.5	Scope of the Research	5	
1	.6	Limitation on the Research	6	
1	.7	Significance of the Research	6	
1	.8	Conclusion	7	
CHAPTER TWO: CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK				
2	2.0	Introduction	8	
2	2.1	Background and Nature of Fair Dealing Exception	8	
2	2.2	Malaysia's Position on Fair Dealing Exception	10	
2	2.3	US Position on Fair Use Exception	13	
2	2.4	Challenges	16	
. 2	2.5	Conclusion	19	

CHAPTER THREE: LEGAL FRAMEWORK

3.0	Introduction	20
3.1	Malaysia's Legal Framework	20
3.2	US Legal Framework	35
3.3	Analysis of the Fair Use Factors	41
3.4	Fair Dealing v Fair Use	51
3.5	Conclusion	54
CHAPTE	R FOUR: RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSIONS	
4.0	Introduction	55
4.1	Recommendations	55
4.2	Conclusion	57
Bibliograp	hy	59
Appendice	S	<i>*</i>
	Appendix 1: Interview Questions	61