

**UNIVERSITI TEKNOLOGI MARA**

**CRITIQUE SESSION IN ART &  
DESIGN STUDIO – A FRAMEWORK  
FOR ART EDUCATION**

**ZUHAILI AKMAL ISMAIL**

Thesis submitted in fulfillment  
of the requirements for the degree of  
**Doctor of Philosophy**

**Faculty of Education**

April 2017

## AUTHOR'S DECLARATION

I declare that the work in this thesis was carried out in accordance with the regulations of Universiti Teknologi MARA. It is original and is the result of my own work, unless otherwise indicated or acknowledged as referenced work. This thesis has not been submitted to any other academic institution or non-academic institution for any other degree or qualification.

I, hereby, acknowledge that I have been supplied with the Academic Rules and Regulations for Post Graduate, Universiti Teknologi MARA, regulating the conduct of my study and research.

Name of Student	:	Zuhaili Akmal Ismail
Student I.D. No.	:	2010759573
Program	:	Doctor of Philosophy (Education) – ED990
Faculty	:	Education
Thesis Title	:	Critique Session in Art & Design Studio: A Framework for Art Education
Signature of Student	:	.....
Date	:	April 2017

## ABSTRACT

Critique session for art students is for good ideas to emerge while simultaneously refining the feedback necessary to resolve any problems within the students' design work. Unfortunately, students and art educators perceived this session as a daunting process due to the non-existent strategies or frameworks in creating a positive and collaborative learning approach for both parties. Moreover, for art educators in Malaysia, there are no references for the general guideline to good practices in critique session in the documents provided by the Malaysia Qualifications Agency (MQA) Code of Practice for Programme Accreditation (COPPA) and the Code of Practice for Institutional Audit (COPIA). This research is a mixed methods research which utilized both qualitative and quantitative methods that identify factors that contribute to student satisfaction and dissatisfaction in the existing critique session, design and develop a critique session framework for the teaching and learning in art & design studio and evaluate the effectiveness of the new framework for the teaching and learning in art & design studio. The research method framework is divided into three phases: the pilot study (online survey), pre-design and development (observation & focus group) and post-design and development (online survey). The pilot study (online survey) suggested a low rate of students' satisfaction towards the existing critique session students' and general dispositions toward five dissatisfaction factors including course activity, processed induced, educator's performance, teaching materials and didactic competencies. Through the pre-design and development (observation), the researcher discovered that there are two types of student behaviours and learning preferences which are non-participants and semi-active participants. These learning preferences were later adapted in designing a new framework, the ZA Framework. Through the online survey in the post-design and development phase, the total mean score for all dimensions (positive climate, class management, productivity, student engagement and teacher sensitivity) were almost to 3 (high agreement), reflecting a positive student attitude towards the ZA Framework. The majority of each dimension was under dispersed which fulfill the model fit. This finding is in agreement that the ZA Framework allows the expression and elaboration of instrumental meanings within the Malaysia art & design studio through a critique session.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First and foremost, I would like to thank God. Without Him I am nothing. I praise Him for allowing me to go through this journey, which has been challenging, and yet at the same time contributed to my extreme growth spiritually, emotionally, and physically. He has shaped who I am today.

This research is a collaborative project in the fullest sense, born out of many journey. This collaboration could not have been realized without my supervisors Dr. Harrinni Md Noor, Dr. Mohd Khairezan Rahmat, Professor Dr. Hj. Abdul Shukor Hashim and the faculty members of the Faculty of Education, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM).

I am deeply grateful to Amierul Sharudin, Faizal Hamid, Ken Kamarudin, Illyana Irni, Melon Abas and my family for their infinite patience and support throughout every stage of the writing of this thesis.

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<b>Page</b>
<b>CONFIRMATION BY PANEL OF EXAMINERS</b>	ii
<b>AUTHOR'S DECLARATION</b>	iii
<b>ABSTRACT</b>	iv
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT</b>	v
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS</b>	vi
<b>LIST OF TABLES</b>	x
<b>LIST OF FIGURES</b>	xii
<b>LIST OF PLATES</b>	xiii
<b>CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION</b>	1
1.1 Introduction	1
1.2 Statement of Problem	2
1.3 Purpose of Study	4
1.4 Research Objectives	5
1.5 Research Questions	5
1.6 Significance the of Study	5
1.7 Limitation of the Study	7
1.8 Operational Terms and Definition	8
1.8.1 Art Education	8
1.8.2 Art & Design Studio	9
1.8.3 Assessment	9
1.8.4 Criticism	9
1.8.5 Design Work/Projects	9
1.8.6 Learning	9
1.8.7 Western	10
1.9 Summary	10
<b>CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	11
2.1 Introduction	11