

## Influence of Religious Affiliation on the Affective, Normative, and Continuance Commitment: An Analysis of Pakistan Health Sector

Seema Afzal<sup>1</sup> & Ilhaamie Abdul Ghani Azmi<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur 50603, Malaysia

#### Abstract

Different religions have their distinct values and morals, Islam is a religion that teaches its followers with dignity, honesty, commitment, and faith in life. However, this study investigates the religiously affiliated employees and their job commitment concerning to their feeling of emotional attachment, norms, fear of the cost associated with either staying or leaving the workplace. After the structural equation modelling analysis of 428 employees from the health sector of Pakistan, all the forms of commitment; affective, normative, and continuance commitment were found to be affected by the religious affiliation of employees. Moreover, the normative commitment was found to be the most effective form of commitment amongst the religiously associated employees. This study found that religion and work are related to each other and cannot be separated or ignored, it will help the organizations with committed employees by implicating the work practices according to the behavioural aspect of the employees, including, religion.

*Keywords:* Religious affiliation; Affective commitment; Normative commitment; Continuance commitment; Health sector of Pakistan

#### INTRODUCTION

Received: 10 January 2021 Accepted: 21 March 2021 Published: 30 June 2021 Employees in organizations are a viable asset, their behaviours at the workplace have been studied by various researchers (Mehrez & Bakri, 2018), affiliation with their religion is more than a personality behaviour (Adkins &

Premeaux, 2019). Religious affiliation with aspect to different religions have been studied by the researchers, as they found that an individual's religion helps to effect the behaviour including; individual's workplace norms, morals and commitment (Ali & Al-Owaihan, 2008; Ali et al., 2016; Gyekye & Haybatollahi, 2012; Héliot et al., 2020; Messarra, 2014; Sloan et al., 1999). Religious affiliation helps to modify individual's life as suggested by Field (2014) and workplace behaviour (Cowart et al., 2014). A kind of human behaviour in the study of social science (Massey & Higgins, 2011) and explored as an important factor that cannot be ignored in organizational behavioural studies (Gyekye & Haybatollahi, 2012). According to Weaver and Stansbury (2014), religion is a set of values and norms followed by people in a special context shaping their behaviours and attitudes as well as living standards according to their specified



religion. They further elaborated that, the world has been divided into several religions and their followers are following religion in their personal and professional lives. Islamic countries having organizational norms followed by the employees more associated with their religion.

In the list of the world's most populated countries, Pakistan is on the 5th number of highly populated countries and considered as an underdeveloped country pursuing development. The service sector of Pakistan is covering 55% of the GDP in the country's economy (Burhan et al., 2020; World Trade Organisation, 2020). Out of the total GDP, 2.6% is covered by the health sector of Pakistan, comprising public and private health centres (WHO, 2019). Consisted of both Muslims and non-Muslims sharing different designations at a job. Several studies are conducted in Pakistan but with different religious aspects (Ahmad et al., 2010; Chughtai & Zafar, 2006; Khowaja, Rabi, Merchant, 2019; Malik et al., 2017; Murtaza et al., 2016; Rahman et al., 2008; Torlak & Kuzey, 2019). Religion is more than a personal matter and became a social norm that individuals need to follow depending upon their level of affiliations with the religion. Being a Muslim country, it is expected from its believers to follow the teachings of Islam. Muslim employees working in organizations will carry with themselves their customs and traditions followed as Muslim. Difference existing between their level of affiliation with religion and depending upon this association the level of commitment with the workplace also differs. Islam imparts its followers to have satisfaction in their personal and professional life. It teaches its followers to stay loyal and committed with their work (Rahman & Shahid, 2009).

Previous studies found a lack of research in organizational studies with the religious context. Religion in relation to employee commitment is also a new paradigm of research. The health sector of Pakistan is comprised of medical and non-medical staff; this study will help to explore the religious affiliation from those which are in direct contact with people. Religion has been discussed by many researchers in different contexts (Farrukh et al., 2016a; Hadi et al., 2014; Hassan et al., 2015; Messarra, 2014, 2014; Olowookere, 2014) but a little research with employee commitment in the Pakistan health sector. There is a dire need to investigate the impact of employees' affiliation with their religion on how well they are committed to their organization. Employee's culture of living changes depending upon their religious values (McClendon, 2013). Islam as compared to other religions has different norms motivating its followers to work efficiently and effectively towards the betterment of



the workplace (Etherington, 2019). Organizations are working towards hiring more workforce fulfilling the demand of the society, as the population is increasing gradually. However, Pakistan being a country with a population of different religions and religious values, need to deal with their culture and perspectives.

Among the various researchers, Héliot et al., (2020) researched to find the influence of religion on employee commitment and explored the religiously associated people are more towards pursuance of positive behaviour including citizenship behaviour leading towards commitment. While, another research explored the other side of the picture, by exploring the negative consequences of more strictness of religion by its followers, they are found to be resistant towards other religions' individuals or less religious (Harris & Yancey, 2017). Further studies investigated religiously affiliated employees are more faithful towards their life as well as their work (Flanigan, 2009). The present study is going to examine the concept of employee's religious affiliation and its influence on their work commitment and to find that the employees associated with their religion are having associations with their organization. Pakistan is considered as the study population to conduct the research. As it is a country with the name of Islam, having a Muslim majority population, non-Muslims are also in minority (Burki & Ziring, 2020). Every person has the right to live according to religious values and norms. This study will find out the relationship of the religious affiliation of health sector employees with three dimensions of commitment that are; affective, normative, and continuance commitment.

This study will find out that employees regardless of their religion keep themselves committed in the way they should be, or the religious values and norms play a more significant role in their life. The study is based on the employees of a developing country, Pakistan by having a high rate of inflation, the lowest rate of human development index, most of the folks are living near to the poverty line, a lot of brain drain towards other countries for getting better job opportunities, and also many of them are not educated enough to get a job to feed their whole family. Under these circumstances, it is, therefore, necessary to find out if the religion plays its role to keep them committed with their organizations, or they are just committed to their jobs for the fulfilment of their needs.

By summarizing the above discussion, it has been found that the relationship between religious affiliation and employee's commitment has been studied previously



by many authors. However, there is a lack of research focusing each dimension of commitment such as, present study utilizing all the three forms of employee commitment i.e., affective, normative and continuance commitment.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature review discusses the individual view of the independent and dependent variables along with their mutual relationship identified by previous researchers in their studies. The independent variable of this study is religious affiliation while affective commitment, normative commitment and continuance commitment are the dependent variable.

## **Religious Affiliation**

Religion as a part of individuals' personalities playing a significant role in the way they behave. It impacts on an individual's political conceptualizations, their involvement with these kinds of activities have an influence on their religious boundaries (Omelicheva & Ahmed, 2018). A study incorporating the integrity of students based on their religious affiliations measured their level of religiosity as a predictor of ethical conduct. It explored that those students which are more religious have a smaller number of unethical conduct as compared to those having less religious association (Nelson et al., 2017). It impacts on individual activity in business, culture, legal affairs (Kleinman & Lin, 2017). Religion impacts individuals' behaviours more positively or negatively depending upon their association, lowers stress, and other negative happenings of life (Sigurvinsdottir et al., 2017).

Religious affiliation is the impact of employees' religious norm and commitment upon their job (Messarra, 2014). Religion has more vibrant impact on the employees' job outcomes; varies in between cultural and religiously devoted values (Wang & Huang, 2019). Employees become more satisfied with their job if the organization provides workplace and religious flexibility along with consolation in their job (Kehinde & Malik, 2014). Social identity theory has been discussed previously with other employee organizational as, family-supportive working environment, work-family conflicts, job satisfaction (Malik & Nicholson, 2020; Akingbola & van den Berg, 2019a; Andersén, 2019; Joong et al., 2019), while working culture plays a significant role (Moore, 2020). Islam as a religion teaches us the value of contract and



organizations also penalties' their employees for breaching contract. It has been notified in several studies that among the other practice by organizations, religious freedom is the most effective for employees (Whyman & Petrescu, 2015).

## Affective Commitment

Affective commitment (AC) is emotional affiliation of an employee's considering the organization as part of their identification (Williams, 2007). It is a kind of emotional attachment coming after the achievement of a level of satisfaction (Mercurio, 2015). Employees satisfied with their work are found to be more emotionally attached enhancing affective commitment. This type of employee commitment is highly beneficial in the favour of the organization (Lores et al., 2016). The emotional attachment is the strongest feeling an employee can have, it is the most honest affiliation. Organizational performance depends upon the employees and their level of performance, commitment is a tool for the employees to achieve that performance level. Affective commitment directly interacted with the employee workplace behavioural outcomes (Dias et al., 2018). Affective commitment is found to be more efficient in organizational related activities (Meyer et al., 2002a).

Employees are more involved in the behaviour considerations aligned with an affective commitment that is the emotional attachment (Allen & Meyer, 1996b). Religion is more sophistically impacting affective commitment showing positive and influencing relationships as compared to normative and continuance commitment (Salahudin et al., 2016a). Other studies also identified a significant relationship between affective, normative, continuance commitment with the religious affiliation of employees. They explored not only commitment, but religion has a relationship with every part or dimension of commitment (Anvari et al., 2014; Dias et al., 2018; Farrukh et al., 2016a; Hadi et al., 2014; Meyer et al., 2002a, 2002b, 2012; Meyer & Parfyonova, 2010; Rahman & Shahid, 2009; Rokhman, 2010; Sadozai, 2016; Sadozai & Yousufzai, 2013; Salahudin et al., 2016a).

## **Normative Commitment**

Normative Commitment (NC) is the normative or morality of an individual to stay with the organization for an obligatory purpose (Christiani, 2016). In the normative commitment, employee considers it to be a kind of exchange relationship to stay with



the organization as a matter of norms and ethical considerations. They wanted to stay with their workplace, because of the perception that leaving the workplace will not be the right thing or immoral (Allen & Meyer, 1996b). The normative commitment may result in lessening the employee absenteeism, spending a quality day at work (Meyer et al., 2002b). It depends upon the values and norms of individuals, either they are more likely to reflect their norms in workplace paradigms or their behaviour is depending upon the workplace situation (Jaros, 2017). Hence, normative commitment also carries importance in the commitment.

#### **Continuance Commitment**

Continuance Commitment (CC), is an employee consideration of decision making either to stay or leave based on the cost-benefit analysis (Allen & Meyer, 1996a). Employee personal capacity depends more on the enhancement of continuance commitment as compared to the organizational practices (Eleanna, 2019). There are several benefits of staying for a long time with the organization such as pension, gratuity, employee old-age benefits, and most importantly the time invested with the organization (Allen & Meyer, 1990a; Borghei et al., 2010; Meyer et al., 2002a). These benefits, if exceeds more than the opportunity to move to a new place, the employee can have a state of continuance commitment. Continuance commitment depends upon the family and cultural values that enhance the individual's capacity to stay or leave with the workplace in long run. Continuance commitment as the name identifies is the need of an individual to stay with the same job as a matter of cost that is associated with leaving the organization (Allen & Meyer, 1990b). Conditionally, the comparative cost is exceeding the cost of staying, the employees continue with the same job.

## **Conceptual Framework and Hypothesis Development**

This study is determined to explore the relationship between employee's religious affiliation with the employee's affective, normative, and continuance job commitment. This undiscovered area of research will find out the relationship from the deep learning of commitment. Previous studies, in contrast, found the relationship between religious affiliation of employees with commitment (Ali & Al-Owaihan, 2008; Hadi et al., 2014; Mansor et al., 2018; Messarra, 2014; Shakil, 2011; Rokhman, 2010), but fewer in the context of Pakistan. A lack of research found to be conducted in between the dimensions of commitment that are; affective, normative and continuance



commitment. Religion is influencing the employee's intention to continue with the organization in the stance. According to research on analysing continuance commitment, individuals which are more religious are not much attracted to the benefits and costs, they are having the perception of losing one job can get another job by having faith in their religion (Roundy, 2009). The more religious organizations have more committed employees as the employees found themselves to be emotionally attached to their workplace (Tracey, 2012). Religion also prioritizes employee's to give respect to the others and to stay committed as a part of their norms (Etherington, 2019).

Weaver Gary, (2014) in a study based on the theoretical aspects of social identity theory also dignifies the importance of the organizations being religiously associated have their employees with strong influence of their religion that ensures the practice of organizational commitment. Researchers supporting the relationship between religious affiliation of employees and its impact on the affective commitment, exploring the positive influence of affective commitment, being a part of an employee's personality, religion has a strong influence on the affective commitment (King & Williamson, 2005). Affective commitment is defined by many scholars is the emotional attachment of individuals (Rhoades & Eisenberger, 2002; Salahudin et al., 2016a). This attachment is consequently influenced more if there is an involvement of personality traits. On the other hand, also effecting n normative commitment, religiously associated Individuals are found to stay loyal and stay for a long time with their organization, because of finding a sense of morality and duty imposed by religious norms (Park & Smith, 2000). Moreover, the idea of being associated with the organization is the part of an employee's norms and morale (Jaros, 2007).

Employees that are more associated with religion are found to have stronger affection that leads them towards affective commitment (Farrukh et al., 2016b), hence it is investigated to be more influencing then normative and continuance commitment. A study comprising comparative analysis between religious and non-religious institutions identified the relationship between religious centre more with affective commitment and normative commitment is found in the non-religious centre (McInerney et al., 2015). Thus, identifying more paradigms to the people which are religiously associated with having more psychological involvement with their workplace as compared to nonreligious ones. On the other side, non-religious found to keep associated with the workplace as a matter of norms, having normative commitment. Therefore, above discussion of the previous literature identified the need to find the independent



influence of employees' religious affiliation on their affective, normative and continuance commitment. Following hypotheses have been designed to conduct the study:

 $H_1$ : Religious affiliation significantly influences Muslim employee's affective commitment.

 $H_2$ : Religious affiliation significantly influences Muslim employee's normative commitment.

 $H_3$ : Religious affiliation significantly influences Muslim employee's continuance commitment.

The framework of the study has been illustrated in the diagram with identifying the hypothesis of the study. The figure.1 shows the independent variable, which is religious affiliation, dependent variables that are, affective, normative and continuance commitment.



Figure 1: Conceptual Framework

## **Theoretical Interpretations**

This study is based on the theoretical aspects of social identity theory that relates to the concept of present study which is to explore the identical aspects of religiously affiliated people and their behavioural outcomes. Social identity theory perceives that in the organizational studies, an individual has a personal identity which distinguishes him

77

eISSN 2600-9374 © 2021 Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



in society (Weaver & Stansbury, 2014). The powerful aspects of religion in society are more concerned with the peripheral psychological interpretation of an employee and is effective to them while at work or even in personal life (Tajfel & Turner, 2004). Present study is elaborating the factor of being associated with a religion that teaches its followers to be stay loyal to their workplace as a part of their norms. As in the case of Pakistan health sector employee's, they are necessarily involved to pursue commitment due to their religious identity, norms, and values. This study follows the theoretical framework and interpretational aspect. Gary and Jason exploring the religion at the workplace described the effect of religiously associated employees carry their sense of commitment reflecting in the behaviour. They also comprehended that the impact of employee's religious commitment on workplace behaviour is sometimes less or more than the expectations (Weaver Gary, 2014).

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

Research methodology is an important part of the study that discusses the methods and reason to utilize these methods to conduct the research. This section explained the research instrument, sampling technique and data collection methods for the study.

#### **Research Instruments**

Present study aims to provide with the empirical evidence about the relationship between employee's religious affiliation and their workplace commitment which are, affective, normative, continuance commitment. With the use of the instruments from the previous researchers, this study took the support of the following items of questionnaires to test the hypothesis of the study.

To measure the religious affiliation of employees 7-items instrument by (Jaume et al., 2013) was adapted, taken from the original Gorsuch & McPherson (1989) model of religious affiliation. The instrument aims to find the extent of religiosity in the followers of a religion. It consisted of 7-items that elaborate on the behaviour of the followers of a religion and their choices to adapt the religion in their personal and professional lives. Employee commitment was measured by the help of (Jaros, 2007) taken from the Meyer and Allen model of commitment. This 20-items scale measures



the employee commitment in three forms, the first 8-items measure the affective commitment of employees with their workplace. The next 5-items measure the normative commitment while the remaining 7-items measure the continuance commitment of employees.

## **Data Collection**

The survey questionnaire is used for the purpose of data collection. Instruments developed by previous researchers are adapted to conclude the results. Questionnaires are distributed online and by hand distribution also conducted to ensure an efficient and effective data collection at the same time. Utilization of both methods simultaneously, make more productive and authentic data collection (Szolnoki & Hoffmann, 2013). Moreover, the purpose of collecting the data by online survey is to save the time and effort to transfer it on the software for analysis. The questionnaire survey is comprised of three parts, in the first part, a brief introduction for the study is defined. The second part consisted of the demographics of respondents; the third part consists of the questionnaire items to be answered on a scale of 1 to 5. These questionnaires when distributed among the hospital staff, it was ensured that all the respondents should be Muslims. Pakistan, being a Muslim majority country made it convenient to find the impact of religion on Muslims, and they remain free to answer.

### Participants

The health sector of Pakistan has been comprised with thousands of health workers, working at different levels such as Doctors, nurses, paramedical staff, human resource officers, accounts, and administrative staff. The respondents are from the Allied hospital, DHQ, Jinnah hospital, and Punjab institute of cardiology. The reason behind selecting these hospitals is that all of them are the Government hospitals of the respective cities, with a huge number of medical staff. A total of 800 questionnaires are equally distributed among the Muslim employees of these hospitals. The response of 428 found to be valid after refinement from the returned response of 489 questionnaires. These 61 invalid questionnaires are having missing values or are filled improperly. Hence, a total of 428 valid responses are included in the study.



Data is collected by the support of simple random sampling technique, due to the occupied schedule and unavailability of the health staff. In simple random sampling, every random person has the chance of being selected. The researchers use this technique to cover the large sample size like as in the present study. As per the quantitative research requirement, a minimum of 300 sample is considered as good sample size (Ahmed & Masud, 2014). Hence, the researcher in the present study collected data from 428 respondents with the help of simple random sampling. For ethical considerations, management of each hospital has approved the questionnaire content prior to distribution of the questionnaires both online and by-hand, to avoid any ethical conflicts. Respondents are also informed about the purpose of the study and their identity will be kept private.

## FINDINGS AND ANALYSIS

Findings and analysis include the results of reliability of the instrument along with the demographics of the respondents and descriptive analysis. It also consists of tests conducted for hypothesis testation of this study, for instance confirmatory factor analysis and structural equation modelling (SEM) analysis as performed in AMOS. SEM analysis helps to find out the influence and path analysis of the causal effect relationship between variables (Alin, 2010; Mansfield & Helms, 1982). In this study, SEM has been conducted to find out the influence of religious affiliation on each dimension of commitment, i.e., affective commitment, normative commitment, and continuance commitment.

## **Demographics of the Respondents**

The demographics of the respondents are age, gender, education level, experience tenure, marital status, and religion. The Table 1 for demographics statistics shows the respondents along with their demographical distribution. Aggregate of 428 employees is included in the study as sample from the population, as shown in the table. In the respondents of 428, most of the respondents are female with a number of 269. Male participants are 159 in number with 37%. Most of the respondents are in the range of 25-30 years, following to them, the high percentage are the respondents with the age group of 31-40 years. Marital status has been categorized into two categories such as,



single and married. Married respondents are almost double in number as compared to single respondents. In the part of religion, all respondents are Muslims. The educational wise distribution of the respondents is from high school to master's and most of the respondents are found to be bachelor's degree holder. Work experience is also included in the demographical distribution; 2 years is the minimum experience level, and most of the respondents found to have 6 to 10 years of work experience.

Demographics	Description	Frequency	Percentage
	Male	159	37
Gender	Female	269	63.2
	20 - 25 Years	78	18.2
	25 - 30 Years	220	51.4
Age	31 - 40 Years	79	18.4
	41 - 50 Years	43	10
	51 - 60 Years	8	1.8
Marital Status	Single	176	41.1
	Married	252	58.8
Religion	Muslim	428	100.0
Education	High School	19	4
	Diploma	107	25
	Bachelor	248	57.9
	Masters	54	12.6
Experience	2 Years and below	97	22.6
	3-5 Years	120	28.03
	6-10 Years	171	39.9
	11-15 Years	24	5.6
	16 Years and above	16	3.7

## Table 1: Demographics of the Respondents

N = 428



#### **Descriptive Statistics of Data**

Descriptive statistics test shown in the Table 2 conducted to find the mean, standard deviation, skewness, and kurtosis that denotes the normality of the data collected from the respondents. Normality elaborates the validity of the data and identifies its variations from the normal range (Joseph F. Hair et al., 2010). The values for skewness define the distribution, while kurtosis shows the peak of data. Values for skewness and kurtosis that identifies normality of the data should be in the range of  $\pm 2.58$  (Hair et al., 2010). The values attained after the descriptive analysis of the present survey are within the range of accepted values by researchers. Hence, the data for present study is normally distributed.

Table 2: Descriptive Statistics of Data				
Descriptive Statistics				
	Mean	Std. Deviation	Skewness	Kurtosis
AC	2.31	.812	1.20	1.255
NC	2.01	.751	1.94	1.493
CC	2.72	.773	.183	1.775
RA	2.44	.886	.509	429

# ----

#### **Internal Consistency**

To investigate regarding the internal consistency of the constructs it is necessary to do the reliability test. Cronbach Alpha values were calculated to find the reliability of religious affiliation, employee affective commitment, normative commitment, and continuance commitment. The table below shows the values for each construct with their number of items. Cronbach alpha value under the range of 0.7 is the acceptable values for reliable data (Cronbach & Meehl, 1995). The Table 3, below shows the Cronbach alpha values for each construct. Religious affiliation has the value of internal consistency as 0.944, affective commitment has the internal consistency at the level of 0.968, normative commitment is also considered as reliable at 0.956. While continuance commitment has the Cronbach alpha value of 0.971. Therefore, it has been found that the measuring scales used to conduct this study are reliable and consistent with the idea of the study.



Table 3: Internal Consistency of Constructs				
	Religious Affiliation	Affective Commitment	Normative	Continuance
			Commitment	Commitment
Cronbach's a	0.944	0.968	0.956	0.971

### **Confirmatory Factor Analysis**

The confirmatory factor analysis results are shown in table 4. The results show the item loading, model fit, reliability and validity of the data. The available results indicated the fitness of model such as; RMSEA=0.074, CFI=0.95, GFI=0.878, AGFI=0.840, and TLI=0.940 as suggested by (Joe F Hair et al., 2011). All estimates loaded on the criterion value identified by the researchers as no factor item should be less than 0.5 (Hair et al., 2010). The composite reliability (CR) value that shows the reliability of the data, its value should be greater than 0.7 (Ketchen, D. & Berg, 2006). All the constructs have the values that are reliable and more than 0.7. Average variance extracted (AVE) that should be more than 0.5 (Fornell & Larcker, 1981), values obtained after analysis show all the constructs have valid AVEs. Maximum Shared Variance (MSV) should be less than AVE of the constructs (Essmui et al., 2014), all the MSVs for the constructs of the present model are less than the relevant construct's AVE values.

	Table 4: Measurement Model of Research				
Items	Estimate	CR	AVE	MSV	
AC1	.755	0.955	0.753	0.154	
AC2	.864				
AC3	.874				
AC4	.908				
AC5	.881				
AC6	.915				
AC7	.866				
NC1	.897	0.931	0.660	0.220	
NC2	.846				
NC3	.932				
NC4	.780				
NC5	.798				
CC1	.794	0.930	0.727	0.041	
CC2	.690				

eISSN 2600-9374 © 2021 Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia 83

POURNAL OF ADMINISTRATIVE SCIENCE	25				Journal of Admini Vol.18, Issue 1, 2 Available online at <i>http</i>	021, pp. 70 - 95
_	Items	Estimate	CR	AVE	MSV	_
-	CC3	.680				-
	CC4	.895				
	CC5	.878				
	CC6	.929				
	CC7	.786				
	RA1	.887	0.952	0.739	0.220	
	RA2	.778				
	RA3	.808				
	RA4	.917				
	RA5	.915				
	RA6	.793				
	RA7	.908				

## **Structural Equation Modelling**

To observe the human behaviour, structural equation modelling is one of the reliable statistical technique and to find the cause and effect of the model (Mueller & Hancock, 2008). It measures the structural relationships among the variables and the influence of independent variables on dependent variables with the level of acceptable significance. The structural model has been shown in the Figure 2 below:



Figure 2: *Structural Model* \*p < .05. \*\*p < .01. \*\*\*p < .001

Structural equation modelling has been utilized to examine the causal relationships between RA, AC, NC, and CC. The results provided in Table 5 shows that

84

eISSN 2600-9374 © 2021 Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



RA to AC ( $\beta = 0.458$ , p >0.05) indicating a significant positive effect of religious affiliation on the employee's affective commitment. Results also identified the presence of a positive relationship between RA and NC ( $\beta = 0.494$ , p >0.05). Results from SEM also shows that continuance commitment is positively impacted by religious affiliation ( $\beta = 0.202$ , p >0.05). Hence, all the hypotheses found to be accepted.

Table 5: Structural Equation Modelling				
Path	Direct influence	Total Influence		
$RA \rightarrow AC$	0.458(0.03)	0.458(0.03)		
RA 🏓 NC	0.494(0.03)	0.494(0.03)		
RA ➡ CC	0.202(0.03)	0.202(0.03)		

Note: RA= Religious Affiliation, AC= Affective Commitment, NC= Normative Commitment, CC= Continuance Commitment \*p < .05. \*\*p < .01. \*\*p < .01.

#### DISCUSSION

The present study hypothesized to explore the influence of religious affiliation on employee commitment. All three dimensions of commitment are considered to find individual influence. The analytical results of this study disclosed the presence of a positive relationship between religious affiliation and employee affective commitment. The findings of this study are consistent with the previous studies by several researchers. Héliot et al., (2020) investigated that, religious values impact the emotional distress of individuals which omits their stress associated to work and help them to cope up with the routine matters, it also depends upon their personal preferences to stay loyal with their workplace. Religion teaches the employees with kindness and honest behaviour, which influences the level of commitment in them (Manaf et al., 2014). Studies also found the identity of individuals is based on religion and gender (Andersén & Andersén, 2019), identifying the role of religion in an individual's behaviour. Therefore, the studies aligning to the current parameter of the study proposed to find the influence of religious affiliation on employee's affective commitment. Relating the findings towards current scenario exhibits that employees of the Pakistan health sector are religiously affiliated due to that they are willing to stay with their workplace as a matter of emotional attachment.

Discussing the other hypothesis for normative commitment influenced by religious affiliation. Normative commitment showing the influence of religion on the

eISSN 2600-9374 © 2021 Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



norms of an individual. This study found a strong effect of religiously affiliated employees on their level of normative commitment. Related studies also identified that an individual's norms are shaped based on the religion followed. Employees with more association with their religion are also investigated to be the more normative and friendly approach towards their workplace as compared to those which are less affiliated with a religion (Liu & Luo, 2019). Salahudin et al., (2016) in their study of Islamic work ethics and the impact of those ethics on the employee's commitment investigated that, employees perceive moral and ethical responsibility to keep staving their workplace if they are more religious. This study is based on the religion of Islam, like the current study. Islam teaches its followers to stay loyal, having faith, and stay satisfied in every situation. Sadozai (2016) in their study of Islamic work ethic and commitment of employees with their workplace also found that employees affiliated to Islam are more actively involved in the positive work behaviour, including their effort to keep honest, loyal, dedicated, and responsible words their workplace because Islam teaches its followers, a positive self and public behaviour (Farzin & Hooshmand, 2017). Hence, likewise the previous studies, the employees of Pakistan health sector are willing to stay committed as a part of their religious norms that teach them to stay loyal.

The influence of religious affiliation on continuance commitment is also one of the objectives of this study. Studies consistent to this objective conducted by several authors proposing that in continuance commitment employee's intended to stay with the organization due to the fear of job loss (Haftkhavani et al., 2013), financial parameters are also a part of employee's consideration of being loyal (Korir, 2016). According to Tang, (2010), employees' associated with religion, especially Islam, are likely to be continuing their job for the sake of morality and teachings of Islam, money, and religion are not seem to be related together. Thus, religion influences an employee's continuance commitment. With the minimum influence of religion on the continuance commitment, Freund & Carmeli, (2003) also found that being religiously affiliated, employees feel to continue because of the fear of loss and having faith for getting the proposed outcomes from the organization. Therefore, as the current study predicts the least effect of religious affiliation on the continuance commitment. It shows that, employees of the health sector Pakistan are continuing to stay with their workplace instead of their religious values and more than because of the lack of other opportunities or other circumstances that intended them to stay.



Present study supports the existing literature regarding the influence of religious affiliation on the level of commitment with organization. This study elaborates the distinctive features of commitment influenced by religious affiliation adding both theoretical and empirical facts. Further, this study provides information concerning to behavioural aspects of employees comprehending towards the knowledge to organizations. This study explored that although religious affiliation influences employee's affective, normative and continuance commitment. However, normative commitment is explored to be the most influencing form of commitment induced by religious affiliation. According to the analytical results of this study, norms are more related to religion. Ethical considerations either to remain with the workplace or to leave comes first in the normative commitment. Hence, it is recommended to the health sector of Pakistan to consider their employees' religious values and concerns to secure their commitment with the workplace. Because the religion of Muslims ensures its followers to stay loyal and according to the results obtained from this study. It also shows that the employees of Pakistan health sector consider normative commitment as the most influential to them. Therefore, paying attention to create an ethical environment will help the sector to have more committed employees.

## Managerial Implications

Religion and the behavioural impact from a specific religion cannot be separated. Data gathered from this study will be beneficial for the organizations and their employees in the case when employees will get to be acknowledged of their religious activities, values and concerns will be valued by the organizations. While on the other hand, organizations would benefit by having the information and awareness of their employee's affiliation with their religion and their probable level of commitment.

## Limitations and Future Research

Data collection from only one sector is one of the limitations of the study. The present study explored the influence of religious affiliation on the affective, normative, and continuance commitment, other studies can be conducted on the advanced level analytical statistics to find the impact more rigorously. Pakistan is a Muslim majority country, data collected is based on the Muslim population and people following other



religions are ignored. Future study can also be conducted on different variables or outcomes of religion.

## REFERENCES

- Adkins & Premeaux (2019). A Cybernetic Model of Work-Life Balance Through Time. Human Resource Management Review, January, 0–1.
- Ahmad, S., Shahzad, K., Shams-ur-Rehman, Khan(2010). Impact of organizational Commitment and Organizational Citizenship Behavior on Turnover Intentions of Call Center Personnel in Pakistan. *European Journal of Social Sciences*, 17(4), 585–591.
- Ahmed, S., & Mehedi Masud, M. (2014). Measure Service Quality of a Higher Educational Institute towards Student Satisfaction. American Journal of Educational Research, 2(7), 447–455.
- Akingbola, K., & van den Berg (2019). Antecedents, Consequences, and Context of Employee Engagement in Nonprofit Organizations. *Review of Public Personnel Administration*, 39(1), 46–74.
- Ali, A. J., & Al-Owaihan, A. (2008). Islamic work ethic: A critical review. Cross Cultural Management: An International Journal, 15(1), 5–19.
- Ali, Noor, Chuweni, Ismail (2016). Integrating Awqaf and Zakat: A Case Study of Land Development for the Poor in State Islamic Religious Councils Terengganu, Malaysia. Contemporary Issues and Development in the Global Halal Industry, 29(4), 293–306.
- Alin, A. (2010). Multicollinearity. WIREs Computational Statistics, 2(3), 370–374.
- Allen, & Meyer. (1990a). The Measurement and Antecedents of Affective, Continuance and Normative Commitment to the Organization. *Journal of Occupational Psychology*, 63(1), 1–18.
- Allen, & Meyer. (1996a). Affective, Continuance, and Normative Commitment to the Organization: An Examination of Construct Validity. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 49, 252–276. https://doi.org/10.1006/jvbe.1996.0043
- Anaiz Khowaja, N. R., Fazal Rabi, Nazia Merchant, N. R. and S. Z. (2019). Turnover Propensity among Nurses in Pakistan: Overview and Management. *Iris Journal of Nursing & Care*, 1(2).
- Andersén, J., & Andersén, A. (2019). Are High-Performance Work Systems (HPWS) Appreciated by Everyone? The Role Of Management Position and Gender on the Relationship between HPWS and Affective Commitment. *Employee Relations*,

eISSN 2600-9374

88

<sup>© 2021</sup> Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



41(5), 1046–1064.

- Anvari, Mansor, Rahman, & Chermahini, (2014). Mediating Effects of Affective Organizational Commitment and Psychological Contract in the Relationship between Strategic Compensation Practices and Knowledge Sharing. *Procedia -Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 129, 111–118.
- Athar, M. R., Ahmad, J., & Ijaz, M. S. (2016). Impact of Islamic Work Ethics on Organizational Commitment: Mediating Role of Job Satisfaction. *Journal of Islamic Business and Management*, 6(1), 119–134.
- Borghei, R., Jandaghi, G., Matin, H. Z., & Dastani, N. (2010). An Examination of the Relationship between Empowerment and Organizational Commitment. *Academic Leadership*, 8(1).
- Burhan, M., Swailes, S., Hameed, Z., & Ali, I. (2020). HRM Formality Differences in Pakistani SMEs: a Three-Sector Comparative Study. *Employee Relations: The International Journal*
- Christiani, T. A. (2016). Normative and Empirical Research Methods: Their Usefulness and Relevance in the Study of Law as an Object. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *219*, 201–207.
- Chughtai, A., & Zafar, S. (2006). Antecedents and Consequences of Organizational Commitment Among Pakistani University Teachers. *Applied HRM Research*, 11.
- Cowart, K. O., Ramirez, E., Brady, M. K., Cowart, K. O., Ramirez, E., & Brady, M. K. (2014). *Religious Affiliation : Buffering Negative Reactions to Service Failures*.
- Cronbach, L. J., & Meehl, P. E. (1995). Construct Validity in Psychological Tests. Research Design: The Logic of Social Inquiry, 58, 225–238.
- Dias, R. L. C. M., Sílvio, L. de P., & Barbosa, de O. L. M. (2018). Organizational Commitment, Job Satisfaction and Their Possible Influences on Intent to Turnover. *Revista de Gestão*, 25(1), 84–101.
- Eleanna, G. (2019). Effects of Employee Benefits on Affective and Continuance Commitment During Times of Crisis. *International Journal of Manpower*, 41(2), 220–238.
- Essmui, H., Berma, M., Shahadan, F. B., Ramlee, S. B., & Mohd, M. F. Bin. (2014). Structural Equation Model for Analyzing the Impact of Business Environment on Firm's Growth. *International Journal of Economics and Finance*, 6(9), 177–189.
- Etherington, M. (2019). Religion as a Workplace Issue: A Narrative Inquiry of Two People—One Muslim and the Other Christian. *SAGE Open*, 9(3).
- Farrukh, M., Wei Ying, C., & Abdallah Ahmed, N. O. (2016a). Organizational Commitment: Does Religiosity Matter? Cogent Business and Management, 3(1),

eISSN 2600-9374

<sup>© 2021</sup> Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



1-10. https://doi.org/10.1080/23311975.2016.1239300

- Farzin, M., & Hooshmand, A. (2017). The Relationship between Islamic Work Ethics and Organizational Commitment of Public Accountants of Fars and Kohkiloyeh and Boyer Ahmad Medical Sciences University. *Bioethics Journal*, 7(24), 69–82.
- Fernandez Lores, S., Gavilan, D., Avello, M., & Blasco, F. (2016). Affective commitment to the employer brand: Development and validation of a scale. *BRQ Business Research Quarterly*, 19(1), 40–54.
- Field, C. D. (2014). Measuring Religious Affiliation in Great Britain: the 2011 Census in Historical and Methodological Context. *Religion*, 44(3), 357–382.
- Flanigan S.T. (2009). Staff Perceptions of the Benefits of Religion in Health and Human Services Nonprofits. *Journal of Health and Human Services Administration*, 32(2), 164–194.
- Fornell, C., & Larcker, D. F. (1981). Evaluating Structural Equation Models With Unobservable Variables and Measurement Error. In *Journal of Marketing Research* (Vol. 18, Issue 1, pp. 39–50).
- Freund, A., & Carmeli, A. (2003). An Empirical Assessment: Reconstructed Model for Five Universal Forms of Work Commitment. *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, 18(7–8), 708–725.
- Gorsuch, R. L., & McPherson, S. E. (1989). Intrinsic / Extrinsic Measurement : I / E-ReGorsuch, R. L., & McPherson, S. E. (1989). Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion, 28(3), 348–354.
- Gyekye, S. A., & Haybatollahi, M. (2012). Workers' Religious Affiliations and Organizational Behaviour: an Exploratory Study. *International Journal of Organisational Behaviour*, 17(4), 1–18.
- Hadi, A., Manaf, A., Osman, A., Abdullah, M. S., & Latif, L. A. (2014). Analysis of Religious Affiliation and Workplace Attitude as Predictors on Employees ' Job Commitment: A Perspective from a Public University in Malaysia. 02(05), 414– 421.
- Haftkhavani, Z. G., Faghiharam, B., & Araghieh, A. (2013). Organizational Commitment and Academic Performance (Case Study: Students at Secondary Schools for Girls). *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 69(Iceepsy), 1529– 1538.
- Hair, Joe F, Ringle, C. M., & Sarstedt, M. (2011). PLS-SEM: Indeed a Silver Bullet. Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice, 19(2), 139–152. https://doi.org/10.2753/MTP1069-6679190202
- Hair, Joseph F., Black, W. C., Babin, B. J., & Anderson, R. E. (2010). Multivariate

90

eISSN 2600-9374 © 2021 Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



Data Analysis (7th ed.). Pearson Prentice Hall.

- Harris, H. W., & Yancey, G. I. (2017). Values, dissonance, and rainbows: Practice Tips for Christian Social Workers in a Polarized World. *Social Work & Christianity*, 44, 123–142.
- Hassan, N., Mohammad, A., Mohd, F., Rozilah, A. A., & Ali, S. (2015). *Religiosity Perceptions and Employee Turnover Intention in Malaysia*. 5(1).
- Héliot, Y. F., Gleibs, I. H., Coyle, A., Rousseau, D. M., & Rojon, C. (2020). Religious Identity in the Workplace: A systematic Review, Research Agenda, and Practical Implications. *Human Resource Management*, 59(2), 153–173.
- J. Williams. (2007). Job Satisfaction aAnd Organizational Commitment, A Sloan Work and Family Encyclopedia entry.
- Jaros, S. (2007). Meyer and Allen Model of Organizational Commitment: Measurement Issues. *The ICFAI Journal of Organizational Behavior*, 6(4), 7–25.
- Jaros, S. (2017). A Critique of Normative Commitment in Management Research. Management Research Review, 40(5), 517–537.
- Jaume, L., Simkin, H., & Etchezahar, E. (2013). Religious as Quest and its Relationship with Intrinsic and Extrinsic Orientation. *International Journal of Psychological Research*, 6(2), 71–78.
- Joong, Y., Gon, W., Choi, H., & Phetvaroon, K. (2019). International Journal of Hospitality Management The Effect of Green Human Resource Management on Hotel Employees ' Eco- Friendly Behavior and Environmental Performance. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 76(August 2017), 83–93.
- Kehinde, R., & Malik, A. A. (2014). Islamic Management Perspective Of Human And Material Resources. 19(6), 42–50.
- Ketchen, D. & Berg, D. (2006). Research Methodology in Strategy and Management. In *Research Methodology in Strategy and Management*. Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- King, J. E., & Williamson, I. O. (2005). Workplace Religious Expression, Religiosity and Job Satisfaction: Clarifying a Relationship. *Journal of Management, Spirituality & Religion*, 2(2), 173–198.
- Kleinman, G., & Lin, B. B. (2017). Audit Regulation in an International Setting: Testing the Impact of Religion, Culture, Market Factors, and Legal Code on National Regulatory Efforts. *International Journal of Disclosure and Governance*, 14(1), 62–94.
- Korir, I. (2016). The Effect of Reward Management on Employees Commitment in the Universities in Nakuru County-Kenya. *Journal of Human Resource Management*,

eISSN 2600-9374

<sup>© 2021</sup> Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



4(4), 37.

- Liu, H., & Luo, J. (2019). Does a Religious Affiliation make the CEO More Likely to use Internal CSRs? Evidence from Chinese privately owned firms. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management*, 1–33.
- Malik, F., & Nicholson, B. (2020). Understanding the interplay of Institutional Logics and Management Practices in Impact Sourcing. *Information Systems Journal*, 30(1), 125–149. https://doi.org/10.1111/isj.12254
- Malik, O. F., Sattar, A., Shahzad, A., & Faiz, R. (2017). Personal Bullying and Nurses ' Turnover Intentions in Pakistan : A Mixed Methods Study. 1–21.
- Manaf, A. H. A., Osman, A., Abdullah, M. S., & Latif, L. A. (2014). Analysis of Religious Affiliation and Workplace Attitude as Predictors on Employees' Job Commitment: A Perspective from a Public University in Malaysia. Asian Journal of Business and Management (ISSN: 2321-2802), 2(05).
- Mansfield, E. R., & Helms, B. P. (1982). Detecting Multicollinearity. *The American Statistician*, 36(3a), 158–160.
- Mansor, M., Akmal, F., Harun, N. A. B. @, Rashid, N., & Ibrahim, R. M. (2018). The Impact of Human Resource Practises, Leadership Style and Religiousity on Cyber Deviance. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 8(11).
- Marri, Muhammad Yousuf Khan, Arshad Mahmood Sadozai, F. Z. (2016). Measuring Islamic Work Ehtics and Its Consequences on Organizational Commitment and Turnover Intention: An Empirical Study at Public Sector of Pakistan. *International Journal of Management Sciences and Business Research*, 2(2), 37–49.
- Massey, D., & Higgins, M. (2011). The Effect of Immigration on Religious Belief and Practice: A Theologizing or Alienating Experience? Social Science Research, 40, 1371–1389.
- McClendon, D. (2013). Shall the Religious Inherit the Earth? Demography and Politics in the Twenty-First Century. *Sociology of Religion*, 74(3), 417–419.
- McInerney, D. M., Ganotice, F. A., King, R. B., Marsh, H. W., & Morin, A. J. S. (2015). Exploring Commitment and Turnover Intentions Among Teachers: What we can learn from Hong Kong teachers. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 52, 11– 23.
- Mehrez, A., & Bakri, A. (2018). The Impact of Human Resource Practices on Job Satisfaction and Intention to Stay In Emerging Economies: Model Development and Empirical Investigation among High Caliber Governmental Employees in Qatar. *Management Science Letters*, 9, 425–442.

eISSN 2600-9374

<sup>© 2021</sup> Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



- Mercurio, Z. A. (2015). Affective Commitment as a Core Essence of Organizational Commitment: An Integrative Literature Review. *Human Resource Development Review*, 14(4), 389–414.
- Messarra, L. C. (2014). Religious Diversity at Work: The Perceptual Effects of Religious Discrimination on Employee Engagement and Commitment. *Contemporary Management Research*, 10(1), 59–80.
- Meyer, J. P., & Parfyonova, N. M. (2010). Normative Commitment in the Workplace: A Theoretical Analysis and Re-Conceptualization. *Human Resource Management Review*, 20(4), 283–294.
- Meyer, J. P., Stanley, D. J., Herscovitch, L., & Topolnytsky, L. (2002a). Affective, Continuance, and Normative Commitment to The Organization: A meta-analysis of antecedents, correlates, and consequences. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 61(1), 20–52.
- Meyer, J. P., Stanley, D. J., Jackson, T. A., McInnis, K. J., Maltin, E. R., & Sheppard, L. (2012). Affective, Normative, and Continuance Commitment Levels Across Cultures: A meta-analysis. *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, 80(2), 225–245.
- Moore, T. S. (2020). Why don't Employees Use Family-Friendly Work Practices? *Asia Pacific Journal of Human Resources*, 58(1), 3–23.
- Mueller, R. O., & Hancock, G. R. (2008). Best Practices in Structural Equation Modeling. *Best Practices in Quantitative Methods*, 488508.
- Muhammad Shakil, A. (2011). Work Ethics: An Islamic Prospective. International Journal of Human Sciences, 8(1), 850–859.
- Murtaza, G., Abbas, M., Raja, U., Roques, O., Khalid, A., & Mushtaq, R. (2016). Impact of Islamic Work Ethics on Organizational Citizenship Behaviors and Knowledge-Sharing Behaviors. *Journal of Business Ethics*, 133(2), 325–333.
- Nelson, M. F., James, M. S. L., Miles, A., Morrell, D. L., & Sledge, S. (2017). Academic Integrity of Millennials: The Impact of Religion and Spirituality. *Ethics & Behavior*, 27(5), 385–400.
- Nik Mutasim Nik Ab.Rahman, & Sharmin Shahid. (2009). Islamic HRM Practices and Employee Commitment?: A Test Among Employees of Islamic Banks in Bangladesh. *Graduate School of Business, Universiti Kebangsaan Malaysia*, 1269–1278.
- Olowookere, E. (2014). Influence of Religiosity and Organizational Commitment on Organizational Citizenship Behaviours: A Critical Review of Literature. *Advances in Social Sciences Research*, 1(3), 49–64.
- Omelicheva, M. Y., & Ahmed, R. (2018). Religion and Politics: Examining the Impact

93

<sup>© 2021</sup> Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



of faith on Political Participation. Religion, State and Society, 46(1), 4–25.

- Park, J. Z., & Smith, C. (2000). 'To Whom Much Has Been Given...': Religious Capital and Community Voluntarism Among Churchgoing Protestants. *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 39(3), 272–286.
- Rahman, A., Naqvi, S. M. M. R., & Ramay, M. I. (2008). *Measuring Turnover Intention : A Study of IT Professionals in Pakistan.* 4(3), 45–55.
- Rhoades, L., & Eisenberger, R. (2002). Perceived organizational support: A review of the literature. *Journal of Applied Psychology*, 87(4), 698–714.
- Rokhman, W. (2010). The Effect of Islamic Work Ethics (IWE) on Work Outcomes. *Electronic Journal of Business Ethics and Organization Studies*, 15(1), 21–27.
- Roundy, P. T. (2009). Work and Religion: Artificial Dichotomy or Competing Interests? 3(7), 1402–1408.
- Sadozai, A. M., & Yousufzai, M. I. (2013). Moderating Role of Islamic Work Ethics between the Relationship of Organizational Commitment and Turnover Intentions : A Study of Public Sector of Pakistan . *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(2), 767–776.
- Salahudin, S. N. bin, Baharuddin, S. S., Abdullah, M. S., & Osman, A. (2016a). The Effect of Islamic Work Ethics on Organizational Commitment. *Procedia Economics and Finance*, 35(October 2015), 582–590. https://doi.org/10.1016/S2212-5671(16)00071-X
- Shahid J. Burki & Lawrence Ziring. (2020). Pakistan. In *Encyclopædia Britannica*. Encyclopædia Britannica, inc. https://www.britannica.com/place/Pakistan
- Sigurvinsdottir, R., Asgeirsdottir, B. B., Ullman, S. E., & Sigfusdottir, I. D. (2017). The Impact of Sexual Abuse, Family Violence / Conflict, Spirituality, and Religion on Anger and Depressed Mood Among Adolescents.
- Sloan, R. P., Bagiella, E., & Powell, T. (1999). Religion, spirituality, and medicine. Lancet, 353(9153), 664–667.
- Szolnoki, G., & Hoffmann, D. (2013). Online, Face-to-Face and Telephone Surveys— Comparing Different Sampling Methods in Wine Consumer Research. *Wine Economics and Policy*, 2(2), 57–66.
- Tajfel, H., & Turner, J. C. (2004). The Social Identity Theory of Intergroup Behavior. In *Political psychology: Key readings*. Psychology Press.
- Tang, T. L. (2010). Money, the meaning of money, management, spirituality, and religion. *Journal of Management, Spirituality & Religion*, 7(2), 173–189.
- Torlak, N. G., & Kuzey, C. (2019). Leadership, Job Satisfaction and Performance Links in Private Education Institutes of Pakistan. *International Journal of Productivity*

eISSN 2600-9374

94

<sup>© 2021</sup> Faculty of Administrative Science and Policy Studies, Universiti Teknologi MARA (UiTM), Malaysia



and Performance Management, 68(2), 276–295.

- Tracey, P. (2012). Religion and Organization: A Critical Review of Current Trends and Future Directions. *Academy of Management Annals*, 6(1), 87–134.
- Wang, H., & Huang, Q. (2019). The dark Side of Feeling Trusted for Hospitality Employees: An Investigation in Two Service Contexts. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 76(October 2017), 122–131.
- Weaver, G. R., & Stansbury, J. M. (2014). Religion and Organization Theory Article information : In *Research in the Sociology of Organizations* (Vol. 41). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- Weaver Gary, S. J. (2014). Religion in Organizations: Cognition and Behavior. In *Religion and Organization Theory* (Vol. 41, pp. 65–110). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.
- WHO. (2019). WHO Pakistan.
- Whyman, P. B., & Petrescu, A. I. (2015). Workplace Flexibility Practices in SMEs: Relationship with Performance via Redundancies, Absenteeism, and Financial Turnover. *Journal of Small Business Management*, 53(4), 1097–1126.