

**ILLEGAL ORGAN TRADING: A COMPARATIVE STUDY IN MALAYSIA,  
INDIA AND CHINA**

By

Erthania Waky (2007143829)  
Fawrah 'Aimi bt Moh Bakery (2007143837)  
Hazim Syafiqah bt Abdul Rahman (2007143845)  
Iziaty bt Abdul Wahab (2007143853)

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Bachelor in Legal Studies  
(Hons)

**Universiti Teknologi MARA  
Faculty of Law**

April 2010

The students/authors confirm that the work submitted in their own and that appropriate credit has been given where reference has been made to the work of others.

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

This research project has been carried out by a team consisting of Fawrah 'Aimi bt. Moh Bakery, Erthania Waky, Hazim Syafiqah bt. Abdul Rahman and Iziaty bt. Abdul Wahab. It would have been impossible to complete this project paper individually since it needs lots of hard work in order to accomplish it.

First and foremost, we would like to further our greatest gratitude to the Lord for the blessing in completing this project paper.

Deepest gratitude and appreciation also to our supervisor, Pn. Sivameenambigai a/p Veeriah , who played a critical role in guiding and encouraging us to amend and improvise whatever necessary to make this research the very best possible throughout the completion of this project paper.

We would also like to express our gratitude to our families for their encouragement and motivation in completing this project paper. Their tolerance of our absence from family activities, their understanding of the time commitment required for the completion of this project paper and their continual encouragement enabled us endure the long nights and lost weekends that made it possible for us to complete this research.

Not to forget our course mates. We would like to thank them very much for their continuous support, cooperation, ideas and advices along the hours spent together finishing this final year project.

Not forgetting the respondents from various authorities who have assisted us in forming our findings in this research, we would like to express our sincere gratitude and appreciation for their allocation of time for our interview purposes.

Last but not least, we would like to convey our special thanks to all those who contributed directly or indirectly towards the completion of this research. Once again, thank you and we will always be grateful for all your assistance.

## ABSTRACT

This research reviews a comparative study on illegal organ trading between Malaysia, China and India. The main focus of this research is to analyze the existing laws in Malaysia, China and India on the issue of illegal organ trading and to propose the reformation of the law in Malaysia regarding illegal organ trading. Data and information were gathered from interviews that had been conducted and from journal, articles, books and websites in the internet related to illegal organ trading.

Firstly, this dissertation looks into the factors contributing to the crime of illegal organ trading in China and India. It also provides some reported cases in both countries pertaining to the issue as well as some suggested solutions. The research also includes scenarios from Malaysia and other countries at large.

In the second part of this report, a discussion on the legal perspective pertaining to the issue of illegal organ trading in the three countries, namely Malaysia, China and India were conducted. This paper lays down some observations obtained from the study of the laws in the three countries such as the *lacunae* of the laws and whether the laws are effective in controlling the crime of illegal organ trading.

The outcomes from the findings we obtained from various interviews conducted with the local organizations are provided in the final part of the report. A conclusion is made and recommendations are proposed based on the findings of the research with the expectation that Malaysia will take precautionary steps and reformations by either amending the existing laws or legislating a specific Act pertaining to illegal organ trading before it occurs in the future.

## TABLE OF CONTENT

Acknowledgement	ii
Abstract	iii
Table of Content	iv

### CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1.0	Introduction	1
1.1	Background of the Study	2
1.2	Problem Statement	3
1.3	Objective of the Study	4
1.3.1	To analyze the existing laws in Malaysia on illegal organ trading with reference to the in China and India	4
1.3.2	To propose reformation of the law in Malaysia governing illegal organ trading	4
1.4	Methodology	5
1.5	Scope and Limitation	5
1.6	Significance of Study	6

### CHAPTER TWO: LITERATURE REVIEW

2.0	Introduction	7
2.1	China	10
2.1.1	Contributing Factors	11
2.1.2	Reported Cases	12
2.1.3	Suggested Solutions	14
2.2	India	14
2.2.1	Contributing Factors	15
2.2.2	Reported case	16
2.2.3	Suggested Solutions	16
2.3	Malaysia	18
2.4	Situation in other countries	19
2.5	Conclusion	24

### CHAPTER THREE: LEGAL PERSPECTIVE IN INDIA AND CHINA

3.0	General introduction	26
3.1	India	26
3.1.1	Introduction	26

# CHAPTER ONE

## INTRODUCTION

### 1.0 INTRODUCTION

Organs such as kidneys, heart, liver and lung are vital parts of human body. Without healthy organs, we cannot live as a normal person. Around the globe, millions of people are waiting for organ transplantation every year. However, the demands for organs for transplantation are greater than the supply we have. This could be the result of regulations prohibiting trafficking of human organs where most countries require living donors to be family members, or that the organ must be removed from a dead body.<sup>1</sup> However, there are cases where organs from living non-family members had been traded. China for example, is known for trading organs of executed prisoners for high payments.<sup>2</sup> India also, is widely known as “a great organ bazaar”.<sup>3</sup>

International organizations such as the World Medical Association and the World Health Organization regard the sale of human organs as inhumane and unethical.<sup>4</sup> According to the World Health Organization,

*“The human body and its part cannot be the subject of commercial transactions. Accordingly, giving or receiving payment for organ should be prohibited.”*<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> “TED Case Study: India Kidney Trade”, available at <http://www1.american.edu/TED/super.htm>, accessed on 5 October 2009.

<sup>2</sup> “Illegal Human Organ Trade from Executed Prisoners in China”, available at <http://www.zhengjian.org/zi/articles/2006/3/18/36071.html>, accessed on 13 August 2009.

<sup>3</sup> “TED Case Study: India Kidney Trade”, available at <http://www1.american.edu/TED/super.htm>, accessed on 5 October 2009.

<sup>4</sup> “Illegal Human Organ Trade from Executed Prisoners in China”, available at <http://www.zhengjian.org/zi/articles/2006/3/18/36071.html>, accessed on 13 August 2009.

<sup>5</sup> Ibid